



Parshas Chukas 5768

July 3, '08
Volume VII Issue 34

Hilchos Berachos part VI

Shinui Makom – cont.

One who begins eating in an enclosed area, loses the *b'racha rishona* as soon as one leaves that area. For example, if one sits down in the kitchen to eat an apple, even if one knew that one will be leaving the room, when leaving the house one loses the *b'racha rishona* and upon returning to eat the apple, a new *b'racha* must be recited.

On The Go

This does not apply when one begins eating “on the go”.

- You're on the road and begin eating an apple, you will not lose the *b'racha* even when you lose site of your original eating place. This is because you were not confined to an eating place, so moving to another location does not affect a *shinui makom*.¹
- You're on a hike and at some point on the hike you drink water. You continue walking and 1½ hour later you want to drink some more water. Since you knew that you would be drinking on the way, you do not lose your *b'racha rishona* and you may drink without reciting a new *b'racha*.

It is noteworthy that although you do not lose your *b'racha rishona*, you might lose your *boreh nefashos*, because if sufficient time elapses (you are thirsty again) you lose the *b'racha acharona* that

you were supposed to recite.² So it is advisable to drink at short intervals before you are thirsty again and recite a *b'racha acharona* at the end.³

If one begins eating in one's home but does not sit down, rather bites into the food “on the way out”, one has not confined one's eating to a specific place and may continue outside without reciting a new *b'racha rishona*.⁴

- You purchase an ice cream and begin eating it in the ice cream store, knowing that you're not staying there. You will not recite a new *b'racha* upon leaving the store because you did not confine your eating to the store.⁵

One who ate outside, while “on the go” will not be required to recite a new *b'racha rishona* when entering a building, even if one decides to remain there, because one was not confined to an eating place.

Entering a car

The *בצל החכמה*⁶ writes the following:

One will **not** recite a new *b'racha rishona* when

² See *siman* 184:5.

³ It appears from *M"B* 184:18 and *Bi'ur Halacha* “*im*” that one may recite a *b'racha rishona* within 72 minutes, even when one consumed a small amount of food or liquid.

⁴ We are not discussing whether it is correct to eat in public.

⁵ *V'zos Hab'rocho* chap. 6 (page 62).

⁶ Hagaon Rav Betzalel Stern, *שו"ת בצל החכמה* ח"ו, סימנים ע"ב-ע"ד.

¹ *Siman* 178:4.

- you begin eating outside and enter a car.
- you begin eating in a car and continue outside the car. If the car was stationary (parking lot etc.) and you considered it a permanent eating place, when you lose site of the car you will require a new *b'racha rishona*.
- you begin eating in the car while stationary and begin to drive.

Leaving friends behind

If one leaves the original eating place and one of the diners remains behind, one does not lose the *b'racha rishona*. Since someone remains in the original eating place, it is as if one is bound to return and there is no *shinui makom*.⁷

This is not referring to a bread meal, which one is bound to return regardless, because one must recite *birkas hamazon* where one ate; rather we are referring to items that require a *boreh nefashos*.⁸

Restaurant

Eating in a diner or restaurant will not contribute to this rule unless the other diners are eating together with you. The fact that other diners are in the same room does not make them a group.

~ If the remaining diner recited a *b'racha acharona* before you returned, you have lost your *b'racha rishona*, because he concluded his meal.

~ If the remaining diner left before you returned, you will recite a new *b'racha*.

Continuous eating

If one eats candy (sweets) at home and leaves the house with a piece of candy in one's mouth, a new *b'racha* will not need to be recited because it is continuous eating. However, a new *b'racha* will be necessary for a new candy, even though

one knew that one intends on eating another candy.⁹

Summary

A *shinui makom* will not take effect when

- eating in the same house.
- can see original eating place.¹⁰ See footnote.
- a member of the group remains behind.
- began eating on the way.
- began eating with one foot out the door.

Vort on the Parsha

The *Meshech Chochma* writes (20:11) that when *b'racha* from *Hashem* is in food and drink, it suffices to consume small quantities and one will be satiated. We see this with the *man*, המרבה לא העדיף – there was sufficient. When the *posuk* says והשקית את העדה ואת בעירם (20:8), man is not equated to animal, because a human drinks a little and is satiated (when a *b'racha* is in the water), and an animal must drink its fill – the ואת separates between man and animal. But when *B'nei Yisroel* did not request and behave properly, they needed plenty water – מים רבים (20:11) and the ואת dropped, there was no *b'racha* in the water and man and animal drank similar amounts – ותשת העדה ובעירם.

Sponsored by ShemaYisrael UK.
For sponsorship, please email
ychody@shemayisrael.com

לזכר נשמת חנה בת ברוך

⁷ *Siman* 178:2.

⁸ Some hold that this refers even to the 7 fruit species.

⁹ אג"מ או"ח ח"ב נז.

¹⁰ This is problematic though when a *reshus harabim* separates between the eating place and where you're standing or when entering another house.

One may receive and distribute these weekly shiurim by calling or writing: Office 99 Rechov Bayit Vegan, Yerushalayim,
Phone Numbers: U.S. and Canada 732-370-3344 Israel 972-3-616-6340
South Africa 076 187 1451 UK 44-020-8731-6666 Australia 61-296835626 Switzerland 0114143 333 0288
• e-mail: shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com, or www.shemayisrael.com,
weekly sponsorships are available as well.

If you would like to send a question to Rav Ostroff, you can write to him at shabbosweekly@shemayisrael.com.

Note: The purpose of this series is intended solely for the clarification of the topics discussed and not to render halachic decisions. It is intended to heighten everyone's awareness of important practical questions which do arise on this topic. One must consult with a proper halachic authority in order to receive p'sak.